



**PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT
ON
EFFECTIVENESS OF WATER SUPPLY
AND SANITATION PROGRAM (WSSP)
IN PROVISION OF MUNICIPAL
SERVICES IN
DISTRICT KOHAT**

AUDIT YEAR 2020-21

AUDITOR GENERAL OF PAKISTAN

PREFACE

The Auditor General of Pakistan conducts audit in accordance with Articles 169 and 170 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973, read with Sections 8 and 12 of the Auditor General's (Functions, Powers and Terms and Conditions of Service) Ordinance 2001 and Section 37 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Local Government Act, 2013. The Performance Audit of "Effectiveness of Water Supply and Sanitation Program (WSSP) in Provision of Municipal Services at district level" was carried out accordingly.

The Directorate General Audit, District Governments, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa conducted Performance Audit of "Effectiveness of Water Supply and Sanitation Program (WSSP) in Provision of Municipal Services at district level" in District Kohat during March 2021 for the FY 2019-20 with a view to report significant findings to stakeholders. Audit examined the economy, efficiency and effectiveness aspects of the services for provision of water supply facilities. Audit also assessed on test check basis, whether the management complied with the applicable laws, rules and regulations in providing and managing the services for provision of water supply facilities efficiently and effectively. The Audit report indicates specific actionable measures if taken, will help the management to realize the objectives accordingly.

Most of the observations included in this report were finalized in the light of written replies of the department. However, DAC meeting was not convened despite repeated requests.

The performance audit report is submitted to the Governor Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in pursuance of Articles 171 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973, for causing it to be laid before the appropriate Legislative/ Executive forum.

Islamabad
Dated:

(Javaid Jehangir)
Auditor General of Pakistan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	i
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ii
Key Audit Findings and Recommendations	iii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. AUDIT OBJECTIVES	2
3. AUDIT SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY:	3
4. AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	4
4.1 Organization & Management	4
4.2 Monitoring and Evaluation Issues	12
4.3 Financial Management	13
4.4 Compliance with Grant/Loan	16
4.5 Environment Issues	17
4.6 Assets Management Issues	19
4.7 Contract Management	25
4.8 Overall assessment	27
5. CONCLUSION	28
RECOMMENDATIONS	29
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	31
RESPONSE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS	32
ANNEXURES	38

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

BOD	Board of Directors
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
DAC	Departmental Accounts Committee
DHIS	District Health Information System
DHO	District Health Officer
EC	Electrical Conductivity
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
GAAS	Generally Accepted Auditing Standards
GFR	General Financial Rules
INTOSAI	International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions
KDA	Kohat Development Authority
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
KPCIP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Community Integrated Project
LGA	Local Government Act
O&M	Operation & Maintenance
PC-I	Planning Commission Proforma-I
PCSIR	Pakistan Council of Scientific & Industrial Research
PD	Project Director
PHED	Public Health Engineering Department
SAMA	Services and Assets Management Agreement
SDGs	Sustainable Developmental Goals
SECP	Securities & Exchange Commission of Pakistan
TMA	Tehsil Municipal Administration
UC	Union Council
WHO	World Health Organization
WSSC	Water Supply and Sanitation Company
WSSP	Water Supply and Sanitation Program

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Director General Audit, District Governments, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa conducted Performance Audit titled “Effectiveness of Water Supply and Sanitation Program (WSSP) in Provision of Municipal Services at District Level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa selected districts at regional HQ base” during March, 2021. The main objectives of audit were to evaluate planning, designing, construction, operation and maintenance of water supply, sewerage, drainage and solid waste system and allied facilities, examining HR policies especially in context of new hiring and managing, controlling and supervising persons whose services were placed at the disposal of WSSC and performance of the department against intended objectives and overall provision of services with respect to economy, efficiency & effectiveness. The audit was conducted in accordance with INTOSAI Auditing Standards as adopted by the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan.

Water and Sanitation Services Company, Kohat has been established on 4th April 2017 as a corporate sector company owned by the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government. WSSC is governed by Board of Directors (BoD). They formulate the policies for adoption by the company. The company was created as separate entity out of the respective Town Municipal Administrations to deliver integrated water supply, sanitation and solid waste management services through the signing of services and asset management agreements (SAMA) with the respective TMAs in 6 union councils.

Expenditure of the WSSC incurred on water supply in district Kohat is as under:

2019-20	Head of Account	Budget (Rs)	Expenditure (Rs)
Administration	Salary	75,956,560	41,011,034
	Non Salary/Dev	62,146,276	21,527,028
Operational	Salary	145,007,978	130,383,226
	Non Salary/Dev	177,231,975	175,072,539
Total		460,342,789	367,993,827
Receipts (Water rate)			Rs 34,642,233

As far as analytical review is concerned, all the relevant analytical procedures were performed on the financial and non-financial data of audited entity to analyze the affectivity, sustainability and profitability of functional and proposed water supply schemes under WSSC.

Key Audit Findings and Recommendations

Key Audit Findings are as follows:

- i. Failure in establishment of water quality monitoring surveillance frame work and testing laboratories.
- ii. Failure to Functionalize the Non Functional Water Supply Schemes and failure to construct new water supply schemes
- iii. Non Operationalization and Utilization of Waste Water Treatment Plant and Solid Waste Recycle Plant
- iv. Public Awareness Campaign regarding Conservation of Sweet Drinking Water and Hygiene Practices
- v. Non-implementation of Key Performance Indicators
- vi. Increase in Diseases due to Un-hygienic sanitation system and poor quality of drinking water
- vii. Non utilization of Water Purification Plant Handed over to WSSC
- viii. No training need assessments were made for the capacity building & health and safety of WSSC staff
- ix. In-effective recovery system for water charges – Rs 17.369 million
- x. Failure to Appoint Internal Auditors and Municipal Warden Officer
- xi. Non Recovery and non-accounting for arrears of water charges transferred by TMA- Rs 14.500 million
- xii. Non shifting of water supply schemes from WAPDA to solar system
- xiii. Non-recovery of loan granted to TMA, Kohat-Rs10 Million
- xiv. Excessive consumption of sweet drinking water due to fixed water charges and non-installation of water meters
- xv. Non Utilization of available Water resources from spring water (Ground water)
- xvi. Wasteful Expenditure on account of hiring of vehicles/ machinery & Manpower instead of Purchase the Machinery & Vehicles- Rs 79.498 Million

- xvii. Poor Performance in Provision of Water Supply services, Sanitation services and Disposal of Solid Wastes
- xviii. Failure to utilize the Nearest Dumping Ground handed over from TMA

Audit recommends that:

- i. Efforts should be made establishment of water quality surveillance frame work including testing laboratories
- ii. Expedite the efforts for functionalization of tube wells and provision of water supply to the community.
- iii. Efforts should be made for functionalization of waste water treatment plant and solid waste recycle plant in order to ensure clean environment to the community
- iv. Steps regarding the safe hygiene should be taken to initiate public awareness in community about conservation of clean drinking water and safe hygiene practices.
- v. Efforts should be made for implementation of key performance indicators.
- vi. Coordination of activities between WSSC and line departments i.e. DHO, TMA, EPA etc. should be made for the control of diseases in the area.
- vii. High cost water purification plants need to be efficiently utilized in the public interest.
- viii. Proper capacity building sessions should be arranged for the staff to ensure appropriate services to the community.
- ix. Effective recovery system should be established for early recovery of outstanding water charges.
- x. The appointment of internal auditors to fulfill the legal requirements.
- xi. Recovery of the outstanding water charges without further delay which could contribute towards operating expenses of the company.
- xii. Sufficient budget and proper strategy may be devised to ensure their round the clock operations for provision of water supply to the community.
- xiii. Efforts should be made for recovery of loan from the TMA.

- xiv. Immediate installation of water meters to all water users in general and Car Wash Stations and Wedding Halls in particular
- xv. Utilization of ground waters to fulfill the rising demand of water.
- xvi. Procurement of fixed assets vehicles and machinery instead recurring expenditure of paying hiring charges.
- xvii. Improvement waste management practices through implementing community-based waste management collection and recycling and supporting the community to design cost-effective systems to collect and dispose of garbage and other solid wastes.
- xviii. Utilization of the nearest dumping ground to decrease its operating cost and to save the time of its vehicle fleet.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Access to drinking water is a basic human need and it is the responsibility of the government to ensure its provision to all citizens. Water is a finite and essential resource, the use of which needs to be regulated to avoid wastage and misuse. Water allocation for drinking and other domestic uses like cooking, hygiene, basic sanitation and other domestic uses shall have priority over other uses. Protection of the environment, safeguarding of health and livelihood through integrated management of water resources shall be ensured. The Water and Sanitation Services Company Kohat is responsible for provision of such basic rights to the public of District Kohat.

Water Supply & Sanitation Company Kohat established as a corporate sector company by the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, has made Services and Asset Management Agreement (SAMA) with TMA & KDA (Kohat Development Authority) which shifted function of water supply from TMA & KDA to WSSC. WSSC is governed by Board of Directors (BOD) which formulates policies for the company. Currently, majority of finances are provided by the government and company's own generated revenues only contributes to 09% of its budget. WSSC is providing services to population in 06 urban councils. WSSC physically took over the water and sanitation sectors from TMA and KDA in Kohat on September 2017. WSSC provides drinking water to areas falling under its jurisdiction but many of these areas are also left un-served due to lack of distribution networks. Though in many areas, people use personal open wells, shallow wells, domestic bore holes and hand pumps etc. to get water for their personal consumption.

1.2 Organizational Structure

WSSC Kohat is managed by the Chief Executive Officer. He is assisted by General Managers HR and Operations, Chief Financial Officer and Chief Internal Audit. All managerial staff is assisted by Assistant Managers.

2. AUDIT OBJECTIVES

Objective of this audit is to find the Effectiveness of WSSC in provision of municipal services in district Kohat. The following were main objectives of audit:

- Evaluate planning, designing, construction, operation and maintenance of water supply, sewerage, drainage and solid waste system and allied facilities.
- Assess effectiveness of M&E framework to manage, control and monitor procedures, processes, facilities, operations, schemes, plans, programs and assets directly or indirectly related to the services.
- Gauge efficiency in expansion, increase, enhancement and improvement in existing organizational capability, new schemes, operations, procedures, making and executing decisions to downsize or discontinue schemes, operations, procedures, processes for the services in line with the provision of the approved budget;
- Examine managing, controlling, maintaining machinery, equipment, tools, plants, vehicles, lands, buildings, structures and other moveable and immovable assets owned managed or controlled previously.
- Examining HR policies especially in context of new hiring and managing, controlling and supervising persons whose services were placed at the disposal of WSSPs.
- Evaluating budget, its execution and reporting operating procedures and their compliance with the Government rules and regulations.
- Steps taken to safeguard public health through effective water supply services and reduction, collection, transportation, recycling and disposing of waste water and solid waste in environmentally sound manner.
- Assessing impact of campaigns launched to promote public awareness on the importance of water conservation, waste reduction, resource recovery and comprehensive and efficient performance of the services.

3. AUDIT SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY:

3.1 Audit Scope

The Performance Audit covers aspects of provision of municipal services by the WSSC i.e. planning, control and monitoring both for outsourced and department funds. Audit covers the period of 2019-20.

3.2 Audit Methodology

The audit was conducted in accordance with International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI) Auditing Standards as adopted by the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan. Besides this conditions mentioned in SAMA, the water supply policy of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa 2015, GFRs and standards require comprehensive planning to ensure that an audit of high quality is carried out in an economic, efficient and effective way within the planned time and cost.

The Chief Executive Officer WSSC was visited by the audit team. The objectives of the inspection were to observe physically the functionalities of water supply schemes. A number of officers of WSSC were contacted and interviewed with a view to obtain information as to how they fulfilled their duties.

3.3 Documents Review

Documents were reviewed to gain an understanding of Water Supply Schemes are as under.

- a. All relevant laws, rules and regulations on the subject.
- b. The water supply policy of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa 2015.
- c. Services and Assets Management Agreement (SAMA).
- d. Budget, releases and funds utilization.
- e. Operation Manual
- f. Record of water supply schemes.
- g. Asset management during conversion of water supply schemes from WAPDA to Solarization.
- h. Progress reports/ Annual performance report.

4. AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Organization & Management

4.1.1 Failure in establishment of water quality monitoring surveillance frame work and testing laboratories

According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa drinking Water Policy 2015, Para 7.10 (i) water quality monitoring and surveillance framework will be established to ensure that quality of all public and private water supplies conforms to the required standards. Para 7.10 (II) describes each organization /department will establish water quality testing laboratories and arrange required staff and equipment to ensure regular water quality monitoring and provision of safe water to the communities.

WSSC Kohat failed to establish water quality monitoring and surveillance framework to ensure that quality of all public and private water supplies conforms to the required standards. Furthermore water quality testing laboratories was also not established in order to provide safe sweet portable water to the community of six urban areas under their jurisdiction. Moreover, no regular water quality tests were conducted from the external laboratories during 2017-18 to 2019-20.

Non-establishment of water quality surveillance and laboratories testing occurred due to weak managerial and administrative controls, which resulted in provision of unhygienic water to the community.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that WSSC Kohat conducted water quality tests through PHED and PCSIR to know about PH, Turbidity E-Coli, chlorine etc. at source as well as at consumer end in 2018. WSSC Kohat wants to establish their own water testing laboratory but due to financial constraints and non-provision of development funds the company is unable to materialize.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021; however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that efforts should be made for establishment of water quality surveillance frame work including testing laboratories.

4.1.2 Public Awareness Campaign regarding Conservation of Sweet Drinking Water and Hygiene Practices

According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa drinking Water Policy 2015, Para 8.3 (i) mass information, education and communication campaigns shall be developed and implemented to promote water conservation and safe hygiene practices. According to Umbrella PC-I for Establishment of “Water and Sanitation Services Companies (WSSCs)” the professional team of WSSC should plan and implement comprehensive communication programme aimed at involving the citizens as active stakeholders in the system and not just passive recipients of the services. The behavior change communication would be aimed at water conservation, waste reduction, waste recycling and payment of dues on time.

WSSC Kohat for the year 2017-18 to 219-20, the local administration failed to initiate neither educational and communication campaign about safe hygiene practices of water in the community nor training programs were arranged to involve local community in conservation of sweet drinking water. Furthermore the company did not initiative any comprehensive communication programme to involve the residents under its jurisdiction to be active stakeholders in the system by changing their behavior towards water conservation, waste reduction, waste recycling and timely clearance of their water charges and other dues.

The irregularity occurred due to weak administrative and internal controls, which resulted in non-awareness of the community about safe hygiene.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that various campaign activities i.e. awareness walks, cleanness drives, assembly sessions in different schools and government colleges were carried out. International days like world water day, world environment day and global hand wash day were celebrated by WSSC.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that steps regarding the safe hygiene should be taken to initiate public awareness in community about conservation of clean drinking water and safe hygiene practices.

4.1.3 Increase in Diseases due to Un-hygienic sanitation system and poor quality of drinking water

According to the chapter 2 sub section 2.4 of the Operational Manual, WSSC will ensure safe treatment and disinfection of drinking water for removal or inactivation of pathogenic micro-organisms to meet the National Standards for Drinking Water Quality (NSDWQ), 2008 and where applicable, World Health Organization (WHO) Guidelines for Drinking Water Quality (4th Edition, 2011). This is critical for prevention of spread of waterborne, water washed, water based and other water related diseases. Disinfection can be done through readily available and cost-effective methods. According to Clause-3 (vii) of Services & Asset Management Agreement (SAMA), the WSSC is responsible for taking all such steps as are deemed necessary and expedient for effective management of the services in order to safeguard public health. To ensure that municipal services effectively managed and solid waste is reduced collected, stored, transported, recycled or disposed-off in environment friendly manner and promoting safety standard in relation to such waste.

Due to un-hygienic and poor quality of water supply and sanitation system in Kohat, the No. of patients of diseases were increasing to an alarming situation from 2016-17 & 2019-20 provided by District Health Officer, Kohat as per detail given below. Moreover there is no coordination between WSSC and Health department for controlling these diseases. Furthermore detail of year wise/season wise fumigation campaign was not produced to audit.

S.No.	Name of Disease	Patients in 2016-2017	Patients in 2019-20	Increase in cases	%age increase
1.	Malaria	15228	28796	13568	89.099
2.	Hepatitis B&C	12738	14138	1400	10.997
3.	Typhoid Fever	14474	2576	11898	82.202

4.	Dog Bites	2391	3625	1234	51.610
Total		44831	49135	28100	

Audit observed that increasing number of patients occurred due to unhygienic sanitation system and poor quality of drinking water.

When pointed out in April 2021, the management stated company conducted different types of water quality tests at different period and found some e-coli at consumer end therefore the company have changed about 20 KM rusted pipeline at street and where the old pipeline was laying in the raw water drain, due to that efforts the unhygienic and raw water complaints at the consumer end resolved.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that coordination of activities between WSSC and line departments i.e. DHO, TMA, EPA etc. should be made to control of diseases in the area.

4.1.4 No training need assessments were made for the capacity building & health and safety of WSSC staff

According to clause 12.2 of the SAMA the second party i.e. WSSC shall ensure use of resources provided by the First Party i.e. TMA Kohat & PD KDA brings in efficiency in water supply, sanitation and waste collection, treatment and disposal and level of services delivery. According to section 2.3 of Operation Manual “upto date refresher trainings including health and safety should also be conducted for staff and workers dealing with operations and maintenance of water distribution system to develop and improve the knowledge and skills necessary to perform assigned job function. Similarly health and safety training must be conducted for the personnel involved in O&M activities of sewer conveyance system.

WSSC Kohat, failed to conduct training need assessment exercises to identify capacity and health/safety related issues in the staff and arrange capacity building workshops in order to enhance their skills and capabilities.

Non-enhancement of capacity building occurred due to weak managerial and administrative controls, which resulted in poor service to the community at large.

When pointed out in April 2021, Management stated that routine practice in the WSSC Kohat to provide on job training session to their committed staff. Many field and managerial staff were nominated for several training courses out district to learn national and international procedure adopted in the water and sanitation sector. Moreover training need assessment in a part of the upcoming KPCIP project.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021; however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that proper capacity building sessions should be arranged for the staff to ensure appropriate services to the community.

4.1.5 Failure to Appoint Internal Auditors and Municipal Warden Officer

According to the Section 39(d) & (e) a qualified person as a first auditor(s) was required to be appointed subject to provision of ordinance and to determine the remuneration, terms and conditions and power of such appointees and from time to time, revoke such appointments and name another person of similar status to such office. According to Section 3 sub clause (xvii) of SAMA Agreement WSSC Kohat being the second party was required to appoint Enforcement Officer and Municipal Wardens for the prevention of municipal offences.

WSSC Kohat failed to appoint Internal Auditor to ensure that the organization is complying with relevant laws and statutes and to evaluate and report on the company's internal control and make recommendations on how to

improve. Further WSSC Kohat also failed to appoint enforcement Officer and Municipal Wardens for the prevention of municipal offences & to issue notices in writing on behalf of the local government, hence resulted in violation of the abovementioned rules.

Audit observed that non appointment of Auditor occurred due to weak administrative controls, which resulted in violation of rules.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that reference to section 39 (a) and (e) relate to first auditor (Chartered Accountant Firm) of the company.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends the appointment of internal auditors to fulfill the legal requirements.

4.1.6 Excessive consumption of sweet drinking water due to fixed water charges and non-installation of water meters

According to clause 3(viii) of the SAMA the second party i.e. WSSC has entrusted the function to promote public awareness on the importance of water conservation, waste reduction, resource recovery and comprehensive and efficient performance of the services and fostering understanding of its importance for conservation, protection and proper use of environment and initiating, carrying out or supporting, by financial means or otherwise, research which, in the opinion of the second Party is relevant to any of the functions assigned to it. According to Operation Manual clause 2.2 water metering will be encouraged initially and enforced eventually to check the indiscriminate use of the underground sweet drinking water supplies and capacity of each tube well will be monitored on regular basis to document extraction and ensure minimum supply required for consumption. All the pumping machine will be fitted with a flow rate indicators and totalizer meters and pressure gauge at source and end user.

WSSC Kohat failed to install water meters to end users of water supply which could have stopped unnecessary wastage of water and reduced the excessive consumption of water. This action would not only stop wastage of water resources but also enhance the revenue generation of the department. Furthermore, the car wash stations and wedding halls may be made bound to recycle the used water for reuse as directed by the Chief Justice of Honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan.

Non-installation of water meters occurred due to weak administrative control which resulted in excessive consumption of water.

When pointed out in April 2021, Management stated that water meter is installed in a system where 24 hour supply of water is ensured. After the implementation of KPCIP Project we will be able to provide 24/7 water system to consumer. The water metering project is included in KPCIP.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends immediate installation of water meters to all water users in general and Car Wash Stations and Wedding Halls in particular.

4.1.7 Weak Performance in Provision of Water Supply Services, Sanitation services and Disposal of Solid Wastes

According to serial No 2 of the Services and Assets Management Agreement (SAMA), WSSCS shall provide the services in operational areas falling within the territorial jurisdiction of the District and as per serial No 3(vii) of the agreement; WSSCS must take all necessary steps for effective management of the services in order to safeguard public health. To ensure that municipal services is effectively managed, waste water and solid waste is reduced, recycled or disposed-off in environment friendly manner and promoting safety standards.

According to Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs 06), or Global Goals, are a universal call to action to ensure that all people enjoy peace and prosperity. Water, sanitation and hygiene

are very essential for sustainable development of any community and are pillars of human health and well-being. Inadequate water and sanitation services will affect productivity, resulting in decline of socio-economic development.

Water & Sanitation Services Company failed to achieve its annual targets set for the year 2018-19 and 2019-20 detail given at annexure-01.

Furthermore there was an increase of 54% in registered complaint for the year 2019-20 compared to the year 2018-19 which also show incapacity of the company in provision of municipal service to the public of Kohat detail given at annexure-02.

Weak performance occurred due to weak administrative control which resulted adverse environmental impacts on the community.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that these are all active connections while the disconnection are not shown which has been transferred by TMA & KDA in SAMA.PC -1 of 200.00 (M) submitted and AA issued but fund not released due to which the target not achieved. Due to covid 19 the target suffered.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends improvement of waste management practices through implementing community-based waste management collection and recycling and supporting the community to design cost-effective systems to collect and dispose of garbage and other solid wastes.

4.2 Monitoring and Evaluation Issues

4.2.1 Non-implementation of Key Performance Indicators

According to Clause-13 of Services & Asset Management Agreement (SAMA), the second party shall on the 1st day of June of every financial year, submit a list of mutually agreed key performance indicators to be recorded by the second party along with the claims for corresponding finance and budgets from the first party for that year.

WSSC Kohat failed to submit the mutually agreed list of Key performance indicators implemented for water supply, sanitation, solid waste management and hygienic services program on the 1st June of every financial year to the first party as per abovementioned rules.

Audit observed that non-implementation/submission of key performance indicators occurred due to weak managerial control which may resulted into poor performance in delivery of municipal services.

When pointed out in April 2021, the management stated that TMO is the WSSC Kohat Board member from the date of incorporation. The quarterly performance of water supply, sanitation services and solid waste management is shared in every board meeting. TMO attend the meeting and evaluate the performance of WSSC Kohat according to SAMA indicators.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends implementation of key performance indicators by the company due to which the effectiveness of water supply and sanitation services could not be determined.

4.3 Financial Management

4.3.1 In-effective recovery system for water charges – Rs 17.369 million

According to Para 8 and 26 of the General Financial Rules Volume I, each administrative department to see that the dues of the government are correctly and promptly assessed, collected and paid into Government Treasury. According to the WSSC Umbrella PC-I (project objectives) the companies will enhance its financial resources and not seek any financial assistance from the Provincial Government beyond three years. Furthermore the WSSC will reduce its losses gradually and will touch the minimum possible level after 5 years. The annual O&M cost of the utility will be met from the overall revenue generated by the entity through improved service provision and improved cost recovery.

Water charges recovery unit of WSSC Kohat failed to recover of Rs17,369,726 from various domestic and commercial consumers of water supply schemes detail given at annexure-03. The recovery system was weak and need to be strengthened.

Audit observed that ineffective recovery system occurred due to weak financial controls, which resulted in loss to the Government.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that WSSC Kohat made time to time operations for all bills recovery and due to Covid-19 recovery process is affected.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends establishment of effective recovery system for early recovery of outstanding water charges.

4.3.2 Non Recovery and Non-accounting for arrears of water charges transferred by TMA- Rs 14.500 million

According to condition 3(ix) of the SAMA agreement, “it is one of the functions of WSSC, Kohat to propose and determine cost recovery measures for the Services provided and suggesting actions regarding taxes, fees, user charges, surcharges, cesses, rents, rates in respect of the Services, receiving and appropriating all receipts recovered in respect there of”. Rule 1 of Annexure A to Para 38 of GFR Vol-I requires the Departmental authorities to see that all revenues due to Government which have been brought to account are correctly and promptly assessed, realized and credited to government account. According to annexure-A of the SAMA agreement, “an amount of Rs 14,500,000 was transferred to WSSC, Kohat as arrear of water charges”.

As per SAMA Agreement with TMA Kohat an amount of Rs 14,500,000 was shown transferred by TMA Kohat to WSSC Kohat during the year 2017 on account of outstanding water charges from various water users. WSSC Kohat failed to recover such a huge amount of outstanding government fee from water users under the jurisdiction of WSSC Kohat which resulted in loss to the company.

Non recovery of water user charges occurred due to weak administrative control which resulted in loss to the company.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that According to SAMA budget the arrear amount of RS. 14.500 million given is a proposed amount and not an actual amount. Nonpayment of bills consumer data analyzed for the amount of Rs. 14.500 million and identified that TMA has disconnected all these consumer connections before SAMA Signing and stand still in active consumer list/data that has been transferred to WSSC Kohat.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends recovery of the outstanding water charges without further delay which could contribute towards operating expenses of the company.

4.4 Compliance with Grant/Loan

4.4.1 Non-recovery of loan granted to TMA, Kohat-Rs10 Million

According to Para-9 of GFR Vol-I, no authority may incur any expenditure until the expenditure has been sanctioned by an authority to which power has been duly delegated in this behalf and the expenditure has been provided in the authorized grants and appropriations for the year.

Chief Executive Officer WSSC, Kohat granted a sum of Rs 10,000,000 as loan to TMA, Kohat during 2018-19 without getting any approval from the Board of Directors. It was noticed that the said amount was not yet paid by the TMA, Kohat despite a lapse of more than two years. Further if the amount was invested in the fixed deposit it could have earned Rs 2,000,000 in the shape of profit @10% for the two years which could meet some portion of towards company's operation cost.

Audit observed that non-recovery of loan resulted in difficulties in provision of better municipal services to the public of Kohat.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that TMA loan of Rs. 10.00 million has been recovered through at source deduction by the reconciliation committee constituted by the Secretary LGE&RDDD Peshawar.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends recovery of loan along interest from the TMA without any delay.

4.5 Environment Issues

4.5.1 Failure to utilize the Nearest Dumping Ground handed over from TMA

According to clause 12.2 of the SAMA the second party i.e. WSSP shall ensure use of resources provided by the First Party, bring in efficiency in water supply, sanitation and waste collection, treatment and disposal and level of services delivery.

WSSC Kohat was handed over Dumping Ground at Dhall Behzadi was by TMA Kohat in January 2017. The local office failed to utilize the said dumping ground for waste disposal of waste collected from the Kohat City area under WSSC jurisdiction during the year 2017-18 to 2019-20. Instead of utilizing the nearest dumping ground the waste was used to be dumped in the remote area dumping ground of UC Muhammad Zai which was some 13 KM away from the city area which not only increase the operating cost of the company in shape of POL consumption but also resulted in the wastage of time of the waste disposal fleet.

Local office did not utilize the available dumping ground due to weak administrative control which resulted in loss to the company.

When pointed out in Aril 2021, Management stated that considering the environmental, technical, institutional, and social aspects of the questioned dumping ground, it is more feasible to opt for the dumping ground situated at village Muhammad-Zai. This is not only in utilization by the WSSCK but other stakeholders in the district are also disposing of the collected waste in this particular site. Further TMA also has the function of building control and failed to stop construction near its dumping site even way before WSSCK took over, rather started dumping in Muhammad-Zai area of Kohat.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends utilization of the nearest dumping ground to decrease its operating cost and to save the time of its vehicle fleet.

4.6 Assets Management Issues

4.6.1 Failure to Functionalize the Non Functional Water Supply Schemes and failure to construct new water supply schemes

According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa drinking Water Policy 2015, Para 6 (i) access to drinking water is basic human right and it is the responsibility of the Government to ensure its provision to all citizens. According to section 3 sub clause 1 the second party exclusively responsible for planning, designing, construction operation and maintenance of water supply, sanitation and allied municipal services and other functions assigned by the government.

Water & Sanitation Services Company Kohat, failed to functionalize the non-functionalized/ damaged water supply schemes handed over to the WSSC Kohat as per SAMA Agreement during the year 2017-18 to 2019-20 resultantly community was deprived from clean drinking water detail given at annexure-04. Further the company also failed to construct new water schemes to meet the rising demand for clean drinking water of the public in the area under company's jurisdiction.

Non construction of new schemes and Non-functionalization of tube wells and water reservoirs occurred due to weak administrative and managerial controls, which resulted in depriving general public from provision of clean drinking water to community of the area under WSSC jurisdiction.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that WSSC Kohat already started their efforts to functionalize the nonfunctional Tube well and reservoirs but due to non-availability of developmental funds we are unable to functional all these schemes.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends immediate functionalization of tube wells and provision of water supply to the community.

4.6.2 Non Operationalization and Utilization of Waste Water Treatment Plant and Solid Waste Recycle Plant

According to Operation Manual sub section 3.1 Wastewater Management Policy the WSSC within its jurisdiction will 1) Monitor all wastewater, faecal sludge streams and effluent drainage from all types of consumers, 2) ensure that wastewater drainage and conveyance system are fully operational at all times, 3) provide sustainable treatment and safe disposal of sewage, and 4) proactively sensitize and educate both staff, workers and consumers on the use of treated effluent for different end uses. According to Operation Manual sub section 3.2 the Solid Waste Management Policy is to focus on providing operational guidance for safe, responsible and ecologically sound management of municipal solid waste. It includes the practices of employing three basic strategies: reduce, reuse, and recycle to limit the amount of waste disposed into landfills. This Policy will be implemented in accordance with the National Sanitation Policy 2006 for promotion of health and hygiene practices.

Management of WSSC Kohat in 2017, were handed over Waste Water Treatment Plant at Bahadar Kot and Solid Waste Recycle Plant located at Muhammad Zai Kohat by Management of TMA Kohat, but no efforts were made by the WSSC Management to operationalize the assets/plants in the public interest after lapse of almost 4 years.

Non-functionalizing the waste water treatment and solid waste management plants occurred due to weak administrative controls, which resulted in depriving the public from the benefits of these treatment plants.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that being a vital part of the Integrated Solid Waste Management (ISWM) System, operationalization of the recycling plant is significant for WSSC Kohat with the provision of the required machinery in the KPCIP project. The machinery and functionalization of recycling plant is very much part of WSSCK and has been in the approved project list of KPCIP. Further WSSCK, under the KPCIP project, construction and utilization of an engineered/sanitary landfill site is also part of the proposed ISWM system that aims to ensure a sustainable practice in managing the waste to

protect the human and environmental health of the surrounding particularly and generally to contribute to the global agenda of the sustainable development goals.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends immediate functionalization of waste water treatment plant and solid waste recycle plant in order to ensure clean environment to the community.

4.6.3 Non utilization of Water Purification Plant Handed over to WSSC

According to Clause-3 (i) of Services & Asset Management Agreement (SAMA), the WSSC is responsible entity for planning, designing, construction, operation and maintenance of water supply, sanitation, sewerage, drainage, fluid , solid waste management system , allied municipal services , facility including hygienic and other functions assigned by the Govt. According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa drinking Water Policy 2015, Para 6 (i) access to drinking water is basic human right and it is the responsibility of the Government to ensure its provision to all citizens.

WSSC Kohat, were handed over 16 Nos of standard Water purification plants in 2018 which were not utilized to provide clean drinking water to the public of the Kohat City and KDA as majority of the purification plants are not in the access of the public, and secondly in all the water purification plants only one tape out of 10 Nos of water was provided for taking purified water which ultimately shows the non-utilization or very less utilization of this high cost purification plants.

Audit observed that non-utilization of water purification plant occurred due to lack of planning and administrative controls which deprived the local public of the area from clean purified drinking water.

When pointed out in April 2021, the management stated that 16 No's of water filtration plants has been installed by CDWA project and handed over to

WSSC Kohat for operation. All given filtration plants are functional and providing clean drinking water to community. The CDWA Project tried to construct the plant near to general public where the main water supply pipe line is available. All the taps are more than 3 times replaced/changed but unfortunately people use to steal the taps.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that high cost water purification plants need to be effectively utilized in the best possible public interest.

4.6.4 Non shifting of water supply schemes from WAPDA to solar system

According to clause 3(iii) of the SAMA the second party i.e. WSSC has entrusted the function and responsibility for expansion, increase, enhancement and improvement in existing organizational capability of water and sanitation, introduction of new schemes, plans, programs, operations, activities, actions, procedures, processes for water and sanitation. According to clause 12.2 of the SAMA the second party i.e. WSSP shall ensure use of resources provided by the First Party, bring in efficiency in water supply, sanitation and waste collection, treatment and disposal and level of services delivery.

WSSC Kohat took over 64 Nos of water supply schemes and constructed 2 Nos of water supply schemes but failed to shift these schemes to solarization from WAPDA to minimize heavy bills of electricity charges. Audit was of opinion that solarization of water supply schemes would not have ensured uninterrupted supply of power but also decreased electricity bill which currently stands at Rs107,984,129 being 35% of WSSC's operational cost.

Non-solarization of water supply schemes occurred due to disinterest of management which resulted in heavy expenditure on power supply of the tube wells through WAPDA.

When pointed out in April 2021, Management stated that WSSC Kohat tried their best to convert the electricity schemes to solarization but due to non-availability of developmental funds the proposed scheme is not manageable. The KPCIP team detail viewed all tube wells and include 34 No's of tube wells for solarization for the upcoming projects.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends that since capital investments on the installation of tube wells are already made, proper budget and strategy may be devised to ensure their round the clock operations for provision of water supply to the community.

4.6.5 Non Utilization of available Water resources from spring water (Ground water)

According to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Drinking water policy 2015 section 7. (i) measure will be taken to identify, develop, protect and conserve surface and ground water resources in line with the provision of the national environment policy and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Environment Act 2014. Due care will be given to the adverse impacts of climate change, vulnerability and fragility, in planning and development of drinking water supply systems.

WSSC Kohat failed to utilize the available ground water resources Spring Water at Gulo Baira Jangle Khel and Oblan Spring water at Jangle Khel as free of cost available ground water in the best public interest of the area. Users of water supply which could have stopped unnecessary wastage of water and reduced the excessive consumption of water. This action would not only stop wastage of water resources but also enhance the revenue generation of the department. Furthermore, the car wash stations and wedding halls may be made bound to recycle the used water for reuse as directed by the Chief Justice of Honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan.

Non-installation of water resources occurred due to weak administrative control which resulted in wastage of sweet available spring water into sewerage system.

When pointed out in April 2021, Management stated that In order to use spring water source WSSC Kohat submit a PC-1 of about Rs. 20.00 million to DC office for Chashmajat scheme and a PC-1 of about Rs. 60.00 million from Biyana spring to LG& RDD.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends utilization of ground waters to fulfill the rising demand of water.

4.7 Contract Management

4.7.1 Wasteful Expenditure on account of hiring of vehicles/ machinery & manpower instead of purchase the machinery & vehicles- Rs 79.498 million

According to Section 6 sub clause 2 of SAMA agreement Water supply and Sanitation Bye Laws the Company being second party shall not appoint any other contractor or Limp to perform any of the devolved services and functions. According to Summary for the Chief Minister Each company was required to allocate funds for the procurement of Vehicles and Machinery & Equipment for the smooth operation of the company.

CEO WSSC, Kohat paid Rs 79,498,000 to various contractors for hiring of vehicles/ machinery and man power for collection of solid waste dumps and clearance of drains within the jurisdiction of WSSC Kohat. Audit holds that incurrence of such huge expenditure on account of hiring charges of machinery and vehicles whereas if the said amount was incurred on the purchase of machinery and vehicles which would result in creation of assets for the company on one side and reduction of the annual operation cost of the company o other side detail given below. Further as per SAMA agreement the company was required not to appoint any contractor to perform its sanitation function and other services.

S. No.	Name of work	Contractor	Year	Amount
01	Hiring of vehicles/ machinery and man power for collection of dumps and clearance of drains	M/S Conpro	2018-19	44,200,000
02	Hiring of vehicles/ machinery and man power for collection of dumps and clearance of drains	M/S Conpro	2019-20	28,122,000
03	Hiring of vehicles/ machinery and man power for collection of animal lashes during Eid-ul-Adha 2019	M/S Khalid Naseem	2019	7,176,000
Total				79,498,000

Wasteful expenditure occurred due to weak administrative control which resulted in wastage of funds and increase in operational cost.

When pointed out in April 2021, management stated that machinery has not been purchased in compliance of the directions of Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as given that all WSSC, Kohat outsourced the Solid Waste Services through private sector and shall float an EOI. The Administrative approval of PC-1 for machinery is given on dated 1st June 2020 by LGE&RDD while funds has not been released to WSSC Kohat to float tender of machinery.

Request for convening DAC meeting was made in April 2021, however meeting of DAC could not be convened till finalization of this report.

Audit recommends procurement of fixed assets vehicles and machinery instead recurring expenditure of paying hiring charges.

4.8 Overall Assessment

The overall performance of WSSC, Kohat in Effectiveness of water supply & sanitation program (WSSPs) in provision of municipal services at District level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa District Kohat were not upto the mark due to poor planning, assets management and absence of master plans of water supply and sanitation program for the area under its justification. The objective criteria for rating the company role in provision of municipal services are as under:-

- i. **Relevance:** The overall process of provision of municipal services was in line with the Government Policy.
- ii. **Efficacy:** WSSC was unable to achieve the basic objectives and purposes to overcome the shortage of municipal services of water supply & sanitation in different areas of the Kohat.
- iii. **Efficiency:** The management of WSSC Kohat struggled to overcome the lack of municipal services within appropriate budget provision and given time line.
- iv. **Economy:** The Company failed in provision of municipal services in the provided budget.
- v. **Effectiveness:** The overall performance was not satisfactory and targeted municipal services have not been successfully achieved.
- vi. **Compliance with Rules & Regulations:** In most of the cases the rules and regulations were followed as per policy of Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and agreement signed between company and Government.
- vii. **Performance Rating:** The overall performance of the WSSC role in provision of municipal services was not satisfactory.
- viii. **Risk Rating:** The risk rating of the WSSC regarding provision of municipal services was medium.

5. CONCLUSION

The overall conclusion of performance audit of “WSSC Role in Effectiveness of water supply & sanitation program (WSSPs) in provision of municipal services at District level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa District Kohat” is as under:

5.1 Key issues for future: The main issue hampered the performance of WSSC in provision of municipal services is lack of planning, funds and weak assets management and non-coordination of activities with line departments.

5.2 Lesson Identified: In view of the observations, it is concluded that WSSC Kohat failed in provision of municipal services economically, efficiently and effectively. The failure to non-provision of municipal services was occurred due to ill planning, inappropriate allocation of funds and weak assets management. The ill planning, mismanagement, weak internal controls, weak monitoring for provision of services resulted in dumps of garbage, poor sanitation, non-availability of water treatment plants. It is recommended that the deficiencies pointed out in the report may be kept in mind while planning for the provision of municipal services in future.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on audit findings and outcome of the audit exit meeting, the audit has formulated the following recommendations which are intended not only to add value to current system and practices but also to enhance efficiency and effectiveness in the management and administration of the WSSC Kohat:

- i. Efforts should be made for establishment of water quality surveillance frame work including testing laboratories.
- ii. Efforts may be expedited for functionalization of tube wells and provision of water supply to the community.
- iii. Efforts should be made for functionalization of waste water treatment plant and solid waste recycle plant in order to ensure clean environment to the community.
- iv. Steps regarding the safe hygiene should be taken to initiate public awareness in community about conservation of clean drinking water and safe hygiene practices.
- v. Efforts should be made for implementation of key performance indicators.
- vi. Coordination of activities between WSSC and line departments i.e. DHO, TMA, EPA etc. should be made to control the diseases in the area.
- vii. High cost water purification plants need to be efficiently utilized in the public interest.
- viii. Proper capacity building sessions should be arranged for the staff to ensure appropriate services to the community.
- ix. Effective recovery system should be established for early recovery of outstanding water charges.
- x. The appointment of internal auditors to fulfill the legal requirements
- xi. Recovery of the outstanding water charges without further delay may be ensured which could contribute towards operating expenses of the company
- xii. Sufficient budget and proper strategy may be devised to ensure their round the clock operations for provision of water supply to the community
- xiii. Efforts should be made for recovery of loan from the TMA.

- xiv. Immediate installation of water meters to all water users in general and Car Wash Stations and Wedding Halls in particular
- xv. Utilization of ground waters to fulfill the rising demand of water
- xvi. Procurement of fixed assets, vehicles and machinery may be made instead of recurring expenditure of paying hiring charges.
- xvii. Improvement in waste management practices through implementing community-based waste management collection and recycling and supporting the community to design cost-effective systems to collect and dispose of garbage and other solid wastes.
- xviii. Utilization of the nearest dumping ground to decrease its operating cost and to save the time of its vehicle fleet.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We wish to express our appreciation to the management of WSSC Kohat in Kohat for the assistance and cooperation with the auditors during this Performance Audit of Effectiveness of Water Supply & Sanitation Program (WSSPs) in provision of municipal services” to the residents of Kohat.

RESPONSE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Para No	Recommendations	Accepted Yes/No	Implementation date	Client Comments
1	Efforts must be expedited for establishment of water quality surveillance frame work including testing laboratories	Yes	Nil	Management stated that WSSC Kohat conducted water quality tests through PHED and PCSIR to know about PH, Turbidity E-Coli, chlorine etc at source as well as at consumer end. WSSC Kohat wants to establish their own water testing laboratory but due to financial constraints and non-provision of development funds the company is unable to materialize.
2	Immediate functionalization of tube wells and provision of water supply to the community.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that WSSC Kohat already started their efforts to functionalize the nonfunctional Tube well and reservoirs but due to non-availability of developmental funds we are unable to functional all these schemes.
3	Immediate functionalization of waste water treatment plant and solid waste recycle plant in order to ensure clean environment to the community	Yes	Nil	Management stated that being a vital part of the Integrated Solid Waste Management (ISWM) System, operationalization of the recycling plant is significant for WSSC Kohat with the provision of the required machinery in the KPCIP project, The machinery and functionalization of recycling plant is very much part of WSSCK and has been in the approved project list of KPCIP. Further WSSCK, under the KPCIP project, construction and utilization of an engineered/sanitary landfill site is also part of the proposed ISWM system, that aims to ensure a sustainable practice in managing the waste to protect

				the human and environmental health of the surrounding particularly and generally to contribute to the global agenda of the sustainable development goals.
4	Steps regarding the safe hygiene should be taken to initiate public awareness in community about conservation of clean drinking water and safe hygiene practices.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that various campaign activities i.e awareness walks, cleanness drives, assembly sessions in different schools and government colleges were carried out. International days like world water day, world environment day and global hand wash day were celebrated by WSSC.
5	Implementation of key performance indicators by the company due to which the effectiveness of water supply and sanitation services could not be determined	Yes	Nil	Management stated that TMO is the WSSC Kohat Board member from the date of incorporation. The quarterly performance of water supply, sanitation services and solid waste management is shared in every board meeting. TMO attend the meeting and evaluate the performance of WSSC Kohat according to SAMA indicators.
6	To ensure safe treatment and disinfection of drinking water for removal or inactivation of pathogenic micro-organisms to meet the National Standards for Drinking Water Quality coordination of activities between WSSC and line departments i.e DHO, TMA, EPA etc should be made to control of diseases in the area.	Yes	Nil	The management stated company conducted different types of water quality tests at different period and found some e-coli at consumer end therefore the company have changed about 20 KM rusted pipeline at street and where the old pipeline was laying in the raw water drain, due to that efforts the unhygienic and raw water complaints at the consumer end resolved.
7	High cost water purification plants need to be efficiently utilized in the public interest.	Yes	Nil	The management stated that 16 No's of water filtration plants has been installed by CDWA project and handed over to WSSC Kohat for operation. All

				given filtration plants are functional and providing clean drinking water to community. The CDWA Project tried to construct the plant near to general public where the main water supply pipe line is available. All the taps are more than 3 times replaced/changed but unfortunately people use to steal the taps.
8	After due training need assessments, proper capacity building sessions may be arranged for the staff to ensure appropriate services to the community.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that routine practice in the WSSC Kohat to provide on job training session to their committed staff. Many field and managerial staff were nominated for several training courses out district to learn national and international procedure adopted in the water and sanitation sector. Moreover training need assessment in apart of the upcoming KPCIP project.
9	Establishment of effective recovery system for early recovery of outstanding water charges.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that WSSC Kohat made time to time operations for all bills recovery and due to Covid-19 recovery process is affected.
10	The appointment of internal auditors as well as Municipal Warden/officer to fulfill the legal requirements	Yes	Nil	Management stated that reference to section 39 (a) and (e) relate to first auditor (Chartered Accountant Firm) of the company.
11	Recovery of the outstanding water charges without further delay which could contribute towards operating expenses of the company	Yes	Nil	Management stated that According to SAMA budget the arrear amount of RS. 14.500 million given is a proposed amount and not an actual amount. Nonpayment of bills consumer data analyzed for the amount of Rs. 14.500 million and identified that TMA has disconnected all these consumer connections before SAMA Signing and stand still

				in active consumer list/data that has been transferred to WSSC Kohat.
12	Since capital investments on the installation of tube wells are already made, proper budget and strategy may be devised to ensure their round the clock operations for provision of water supply to the community	Yes	Nil	Management stated that WSSC Kohat tried their best to convert the electricity schemes to solarization but due to non-availability of developmental funds the proposed scheme is not manageable. The KPCIP team detail viewed all tube wells and include 34 No's of tube wells for solarization for the upcoming projects.
13	Recovery of loan from the TMA without delay	Yes	Nil	Management stated that TMA loan of Rs. 10.00 million has been recovered through at source deduction by the reconciliation committee constituted by the Secretary LGE&RDDD Peshawar.
14	Immediate installation of water meters to all water users in general and Car Wash Stations and Wedding Halls in particular	Yes	Nil	Management stated that water meter is installed in a system where 24 hour supply of water is ensured. After the implementation of KPCIP Project we will be able to provide 24/7 water system to consumer. The water metering project is included in KPCIP.
15	Utilization of low cost ground waters to fulfill the rising demand of water	Yes	Nil	Management stated that In order to use spring water source WSSC Kohat submit a PC-1 of about Rs. 20.00 Million to DC office for Chashmajat scheme and a PC-1 of about Rs. 60.00 million from Biyana spring to LG& RDD.
16	Procurement of fixed assets vehicles and machinery instead recurring expenditure of paying hiring charges	Yes	Nil	Management stated that machinery has not been purchased in compliance of the directions of Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as given that all WSSC, Kohat outsourced the Solid Waste Services through private sector and shall float an EOI. The

				Administrative approval of PC-1 for machinery is given on dated 1 st June 2020 by LGE&RDD while funds has not been released to WSSC Kohat to float tender of machinery.
17	Improvement waste management practices through implementing community-based waste management collection and recycling and supporting the community to design cost-effective systems to collect and dispose of garbage and other solid wastes.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that being a vital part of the Integrated Solid Waste Management (ISWM) System, operationalization of the recycling plant is significant for WSSC Kohat with the provision of the required machinery in the KPCIP project, The machinery and functionalization of recycling plant is very much part of WSSCK and has been in the approved project list of KPCIP. Further WSSCK, under the KPCIP project, construction and utilization of an engineered/sanitary landfill site is also part of the proposed ISWM system, that aims to ensure a sustainable practice in managing the waste to protect the human and environmental health of the surrounding particularly and generally to contribute to the global agenda of the sustainable development goals.
18	Utilization of the nearest dumping ground to decrease its operating cost and to save the time of its vehicle fleet.	Yes	Nil	Management stated that Considering the environmental, technical, institutional, and social aspects of the questioned dumping ground, it is more feasible to opt for the dumping ground situated at village Muhammad-Zai. This is not only in utilization by the WSSCK but other stakeholders in the district are also disposing of the collected waste in this particular site. Further TMA also has the function of

				building control and failed to stop construction near its dumping site even way before WSSCK took over, rather started dumping in mohamadzai area of Kohat.
--	--	--	--	---

ANNEXURES

Annexure-1

Para No.4.1.7

Detail showing Targets achieved

S.No	Milestone	2018-19		2019-20		Non achievement Targets	% age
		Targets	Achieved	Targets	Achieved		
1	Number of Water Users/House Holds	12000	9170	15000	10049	4951	33.01
2	Length of Sewer Line in KM	10	2.5	10	3	7	70
3	Solid waste Disposal in tones	55845	42798	58770	46720	12050	20.50
4	Drainage Line in KM	5	4	10	0.5	9.5	95
5	Replacement of old rusted pipes KM	20	2.4	20	6	14	70
6	Extension of pipe lines	20	0	20	3	17	85
7	Rehabilitation of AC Pipelines	10	3	10	5	5	50

Annexure-2
Para No.4.1.7

Detail showing Register Complaint increase

S.No	Year	Complaints Registered		Total
		Water Supply	Sanitation	
01	2018-19	362	448	810
02	2019-20	773	1007	1780
Increase in Complaints in 2019-20				970
% Increase in Complaints during 2019-20				54%

Annexure-3

Para No.4.3.1

Detail showing outstanding charges of water rates

S.No	Water Supply Schemes	Period	Amount Outstanding
01	Water Supply Schemes in Kohat City (TMA areas)	Jan 2017 to Mar 2021	12,035,942
02	Water Supply Schemes in Kotal Township (KDA areas)	-do-	5,333,784
Total Outstanding Water Charges not recovered			17,369,726

Annexure-4
Para No.4.6.1

Detail showing List of Non Functional Schemes

#	Name of Schemes	Address of Schemes	Design Discharges of WSS	Current Status of WSS
1	WSS Sheri Vella No.2	Sheri Vella Jungle Khel	9000	Non Functional
2	WSS ChekarKotColoney New Abadi	ChekarKotColoney New Abadi	-	Incomplete & Non Functional
3	WSS Jhandi Station No.1	Jhandi Station	-	-do-
4	WSS Tapi	Tapi	-	-do-
5	WSS No.2 Star Pump Phase-1	Sector 1 KDA	3000	Damaged
6	WSS No.3 E2 Phase II	Sector E2 KDA	6000	-do-
7	WSS D2 T/W Phase II	Sector D3 Phase II KDA	-	Non Functional
8	WSS B5 T/W Phase II	Sector B5 Phase-II KDA	-	Non Functional
9	WSS Park Phase-II T/W	Phase II KDA	-	Non Functional
10	WSS Jhandi Station No.2	Jhandi Station	7500	Non Functional
11	WSSC Over Head Reservoirs	Various sectors of KDA	03	Not operational